International Programme on Chemical Safety

GLOBAL ASSESSMENT OF THE STATE-OF-THE-SCIENCE OF ENDOCRINE DISRUPTORS

An assessment prepared by an expert group on behalf of the World Health Organization, the International Labour Organisation, and the United Nations Environment Programme

Edited by: Terri Damstra, Sue Barlow, Aake Bergman, Robert Kavlock, Glen Van Der Kraak
The International Programme on Chemical Safety (IPCS), established in 1980, is a joint venture of the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), the International Labour Organisation (ILO), and the World Health Organization (WHO). The overall objectives of the IPCS are to establish the scientific basis for assessing the risk to human health and the environment from exposure to chemicals, through international peer-review processes, as a prerequisite for the promotion of chemical safety, and to provide technical assistance in strengthening national capacities for the sound management of chemicals.

The Inter-Organization Programme for the Sound Management of Chemicals (IOMC) was established in 1995 by UNEP, ILO, the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, WHO, the United Nations Industrial Development Organization, the United Nations Institute for Training and Research, and the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (Participating Organizations), following recommendations made by the 1992 United Nations Conference on Environment and Development to strengthen cooperation and increase coordination in the field of chemical safety. The purpose of the IOMC is to promote coordination of the policies and activities pursued by the Participating Organizations, jointly or separately, to achieve the sound management of chemicals in relation to human health and the environment.

© World Health Organization, 2002

This document is not a formal publication of the World Health Organization (WHO), and all rights are reserved by the Organization.
## Preface

### 1. Executive Summary

1.1 Purpose and Scope of Document ........................................... 1
1.2 Endocrine Mechanisms of Action ............................................ 1
1.3 Dose–Response Relationships ............................................... 2
1.4 Effects in Wildlife ............................................................ 2
1.5 Human Health Effects ......................................................... 2
1.6 Exposure .......................................................................... 3
1.7 Causal Criteria and Weight of Evidence for Effects Resulting from Exposure to EDCs ................................................. 3

### 2. Introduction/Background .................................................... 5

2.1 General Background ........................................................... 5
2.2 Generic Issues ................................................................. 5
2.3 Mechanisms of Endocrine Disruption in Humans and Wildlife .... 5
2.4 Dose–Response Relationships ............................................... 7
2.5 Exposure Issues ............................................................... 8

### 3. Endocrinology and Endocrine Toxicology ................................. 11

3.1 Introduction to Endocrine Systems ........................................... 11
3.2 Scope and Terminology ....................................................... 11
3.2.1 Overview ....................................................................... 11
3.2.2 Homeostasis ................................................................. 12
3.2.3 Programming of Endocrine Axes ....................................... 12
3.2.4 Impact of Endocrine Disruptors ......................................... 13
3.3 The HPG Axis in Mammals .................................................. 13
3.3.1 Overview of the HPG Axis ................................................ 13
3.3.2 Target Cell Sensitivity ...................................................... 14
3.3.3 Metabolism of Endocrine Hormones ..................................... 14
3.3.4 Interaction of Paracrine and Endocrine Components of the HPG Axis .......................................................... 14
3.3.5 Developmental Role of the HPG Axis .................................. 14
3.3.6 Role of Hormones in Mammalian Sex Differentiation ............ 15
3.3.7 The HPG Axis in Nonmammalian Species ............................ 16
3.4 The HPA Axis ................................................................. 17
3.4.1 Overview of the HPA Axis ................................................ 17
3.4.2 The HPA Axis in Nonmammals .......................................... 17
3.5 The HPT Axis ............................................................... 17
3.5.1 Overview of the HPT Axis ................................................ 17
3.5.2 The HPT Axis in Nonmammals .......................................... 18
3.6 The Pineal Gland: A Photoperiodic Transducer ....................... 18
3.7 Interactions of the HPG Axis with Other Endocrine Systems .... 18
3.8 Growth in Understanding of Endocrine Systems ..................... 19
3.9 Developmental/Programming Effects of Endocrine Systems ...... 19
3.10 Nonreproductive Effects of Sex Steroids ................................. 19
3.11 Endocrine Cross Talk and Endocrine Disruptors .................... 20

### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Executive Summary</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Introduction/Background</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Endocrinology and Endocrine Toxicology</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- iii -
3.12 Modes of Action and Phenotypic Outcomes of EDC-Related Developmental and Reproductive Toxicities ......................................................... 21
3.12.1 Scope of Survey ........................................................................ 21
3.12.2 AR-Mediated (Anti)Androgens .................................................. 21
3.12.3 ER-Mediated Estrogens ............................................................. 23
3.12.4 Inhibitors of Steroid Hormone Synthesis ................................... 25
3.12.5 AhR Agonists: TCDD, PCBs, and PCDFs ................................. 27
3.12.6 Mechanism for p,p′-DDE–Induced Eggshell Thinning in Oviparous Vertebrates ................................................................. 28
3.13 EDC Modes of Action for Carcinogenesis—The Effect of Atrazine ................................................................. 29
3.14 EDC-Related Modes of Action in Neurotoxicity ............................... 30
3.14.1 Overview ................................................................................ 30
3.14.2 Sexual Differentiation of the Nervous System ............................ 31
3.15 EDC-Related Modes of Action in Immunotoxicity ............................ 31
3.16 Basis for Attribution of Effects to Endocrine Disruption .................... 32

4. Wildlife ............................................................................................ 34
4.1 Mammals ....................................................................................... 34
4.1.1 Unique Aspects ......................................................................... 34
4.1.2 Effect-Based Responses and Case Studies ................................. 34
4.1.3 Conclusion ................................................................................ 36
4.2 Birds ............................................................................................... 36
4.2.1 Unique Aspects ......................................................................... 36
4.2.2 Effect-Based Responses and Case Studies ................................. 36
4.2.3 Conclusion ................................................................................ 38
4.3 Reptiles ........................................................................................... 39
4.3.1 Unique Aspects ......................................................................... 39
4.3.2 Effect-Based Responses and Case Studies ................................. 39
4.3.3 Conclusion ................................................................................ 40
4.4 Amphibians ..................................................................................... 40
4.4.1 Unique Aspects ......................................................................... 40
4.4.2 Effect-Based Responses and Case Studies ................................. 41
4.4.3 Conclusion ................................................................................ 42
4.5 Fish ................................................................................................. 42
4.5.1 Unique Aspects ......................................................................... 42
4.5.2 Effect-Based Responses and Case Studies ................................. 42
4.5.3 Conclusion ................................................................................ 47
4.6 Invertebrates ................................................................................... 47
4.6.1 Unique Aspects ......................................................................... 47
4.6.2 Effect-Based Responses and Case Studies ................................. 48
4.6.3 Conclusion ................................................................................ 49
4.7 Uncertainties and Research Needs .................................................... 49

5. Human Health .................................................................................... 51
5.1 Reproduction .................................................................................. 51
5.1.1 Introduction ............................................................................... 51
5.1.2 Sperm Quality and Testis Function .......................................... 52
5.1.3 Fecundity and Fertility .............................................................. 57
5.1.4 Spontaneous Abortion ............................................................... 58
5.1.5 The Sex Ratio ........................................................................... 59
5.1.6 Male Reproductive Tract Abnormalities ................................... 61
5.1.7 Endometriosis ........................................................................... 66
5.1.8 Other Adverse Reproductive Outcomes Potentially Linked to EDCs ................................................................. 68
5.1.9 Conclusions and Recommendations on Reproduction .............. 69
5.2 Neurobehavior ................................................................. 70
  5.2.1 Introduction .......................................................... 70
  5.2.2 Human Data .......................................................... 70
  5.2.3 Animal Data .......................................................... 72
  5.2.4 Thyroid Hormones .................................................. 73
  5.2.5 Conclusions and Recommendations on Neurobehavior .............. 75
5.3 Immune System .............................................................. 75
  5.3.1 Introduction .......................................................... 75
  5.3.2 Human Data .......................................................... 76
  5.3.3 Experimental and Animal Data ...................................... 77
  5.3.4 Conclusions and Recommendations on the Immune System .......... 78
5.4 Cancer ........................................................................... 78
  5.4.1 Introduction .......................................................... 78
  5.4.2 Breast Cancer .......................................................... 79
  5.4.3 Endometrial Cancer .................................................. 84
  5.4.4 Testicular Cancer ..................................................... 84
  5.4.5 Prostate Cancer ...................................................... 85
  5.4.6 Thyroid Cancer ....................................................... 86
  5.4.7 Conclusions and Recommendations on Cancer ......................... 86
5.5 Other Endocrine Systems Potentially Vulnerable to EDCs ................. 86

6. Exposure of Selected Potential EDCs in Humans and Wildlife .............. 89
  6.1 Introduction ............................................................... 89
  6.2 General Exposure Issues ................................................ 90
    6.2.1 Sources ............................................................. 90
    6.2.2 Exposure Pathways ................................................ 91
    6.2.3 Intake and Uptake .................................................. 92
    6.2.4 Internal Dose and Pharmacokinetics .............................. 92
  6.3 Case Studies .............................................................. 92
    6.3.1 Wildlife Exposures ................................................ 93
    6.3.2 Human Exposures—Some Selected Case Studies ................. 98
  6.4 Measurement of Exposure to EDCs ...................................... 101
    6.4.1 Sampling ............................................................ 102
    6.4.2 Analytical Considerations ......................................... 102
    6.4.3 Mixtures ............................................................. 103
    6.4.4 QA/QC .............................................................. 104
    6.4.5 Exposure Models ................................................... 104
    6.4.6 SARs ................................................................. 104
  6.5 Summary ..................................................................... 105
    Annex I ....................................................................... 106

  7.1 Introduction .................................................................. 123
  7.2 Elements of the Proposed Framework ................................... 123
  7.3 Overall Strength of Evidence .......................................... 124
  7.4 Illustrative Examples—Status and Trends Observations ................. 124
    7.4.1 Semen Quality and Testis Function in Humans .................. 124
    7.4.2 Limb Malformations in North American Frogs ................... 125
7.5 Illustrative Examples—Nonstatus and Trend-Type Observations ........................................... 125
  7.5.1 Endometriosis in Humans ......................................................................................... 125
  7.5.2 Impaired Neurobehavioral Development in Humans ............................................... 125
  7.5.3 Perturbed Immune Function in Humans .................................................................. 126
  7.5.4 Incidence of Breast Cancer in Humans ................................................................. 126
  7.5.5 ImpeX in Marine Gastropods ............................................................................... 126
  7.5.6 Decreased Reproductive Function in Baltic Seals .................................................... 127
  7.5.7 GLEMEDS ........................................................................................................... 127
  7.5.8 Eggshell Thinning in Colonial Waterbirds .............................................................. 127
  7.5.9 Reproductive Abnormalities in Lake Apopka Alligators ......................................... 128
  7.5.10 Vitellogenin Induction in Fish Exposed to Sewage Treatment Plant Effluents in England ............................................................ 128
  7.5.11 Developmental Abnormalities and Reproductive Failure in Lake Ontario Lake Trout ............................................................ 128
  7.5.12 Reproductive Alterations in Fish Exposed to Bleached Kraft Pulp Mill Effluent in Ontario ............................................................ 129

8. General Conclusions and Research Needs ................................................................. 131

References ....................................................................................................................... 133
Global concerns have been raised in recent years over the potential adverse effects that may result from exposure to chemicals that have the potential to interfere with the endocrine system. Wildlife and human health effects of EDCs were first proclaimed by Rachel Carson in 1962, and based on a growing body of knowledge, those concerns have increased. This concern regarding EDCs is directed at both humans and wildlife. In response to these concerns, the Second Session (February 1997) of the Intergovernmental Forum on Chemical Safety made a number of recommendations to the Member Organizations of the IOMC, notably, IPCS and OECD, concerning approaches and means for coordinating and/or supporting efforts to address the issues internationally, including the development of an international inventory of research and coordinated testing and assessment strategies. This endorsed earlier recommendations from an international workshop at the Smithsonian (January 1997) and was followed by the 1997 Declaration of the Environmental Leaders of the Eight on Children’s Environmental Health, which specifically addressed the issue of EDCs in their declaration. The environment leaders encouraged continuing efforts to compile an international inventory of research activities, develop an international assessment of the state of the science, identify and prioritize research needs and data gaps, and develop a mechanism for coordinating and cooperating on filing of the research needs. The 50th World Health Assembly adopted resolution WHO 50.13 in 1997, which called upon the Director-General of WHO to “take the necessary steps to reinforce WHO leadership in undertaking risk assessment as a basis for tackling high priority problems as they emerge, and in promoting and coordinating related research, for example, on potential endocrine-related health effects of exposure to chemicals.”

In response to these recommendations, the International Programme on Chemical Safety (PCS) of the WHO/UNEP/ILO assumed responsibility for developing this global assessment of the current state of scientific knowledge relative to environmental endocrine disruption. Concurrently, the IPCS assisted in the development of a Global Endocrine Disruptor Research Inventory (see http://endocrine.ei.jrc.it), which serves as a tool to foster complementary research efforts and identify strengths and weaknesses of current global research efforts.

The IPCS (in collaboration with the OECD) convened an informal consultation in 1997 and a Scoping Meeting in 1998 to outline the objectives, scope, and development process for the assessment document. The IPCS established a Steering Group of the following scientific experts to provide oversight, expertise, and guidance for the project and to evaluate the accuracy, significance, and relevance of the information in the document.

Dr Lawrence Reiter (Chair), US EPA, Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, USA
Dr Sue Barlow, Harrington House, Brighton, United Kingdom
Dra Ake Bergman, Stockholm University, Stockholm, Sweden
Dr Abraham Brouwer, Wageningen Agricultural University, Wageningen, The Netherlands
Ms Kathleen Cameron, Department of the Environment, Transport and the Regions, London, United Kingdom
Dr Fernando Diaz-Barriga, Facultad de Medicina, San Luis Potosi, Mexico
Dr Warren Foster, McMaster University, Ontario, Canada
Dr Andreas Gies, Umwelt Bundes Amt, Berlin, Germany
Dr Tohru Inoue, National Institute of Health Sciences, Tokyo, Japan
Robert Kavlock, US EPA, Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, USA
Dr Herman Koëter, OECD, Paris, France
Dr George Lucier, Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, USA
Dr Erminio Marafante, European Commission, Joint Research Centre, Ispra, Italy
James Seiber, Western Regional Research Center, Albany, California, USA
Dr Glen Van Der Kraak, University of Guelph, Guelph, Ontario, Canada
Dr Bo Wahlström, UNEP, Geneva, Switzerland

This Steering Group met seven times over a three-year period to evaluate and revise various drafts of the document. Several of the Steering Group members served as chapter coordinators and editors and provided significant text contributions. Their continuing commitment to this document was essential for its completion.
The following international scientific experts served as authors for various sections of the document:

Dr Gerald Ankley, Duluth, Minnesota, USA
Dr Mike Depledge, Devon, United Kingdom
Dr Cynthia deWit, Stockholm, Sweden
Dr Richard DiAugustine, Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, USA
Dr Paul Foster, Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, USA
Dr John Giesy, East Lansing, Michigan, USA
Dr Earl Gray, Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, USA
Dr John Jarrell, Calgary, Alberta, Canada
Dr Pierre Jouannet, Paris, France
Dr Jun Kanno, Tokyo, Japan
Dr Diane Klotz, Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, USA
Dr Hellmuth Lilienthal, Duesseldorf, Germany
Ms Andrea Lister, Guelph, Ontario, Canada
Dr Lizbeth López-Carrillo, Cuernavaca, Mexico
Dr Bert-Ove Lund, Uppsala, Sweden
Dr Peter Matthiessen, Lund, Essex, United Kingdom
Dr Larry Needham, Atlanta, Georgia, USA
Dr David Norris, Boulder, Colorado, USA
Dr Mats Olsson, Stockholm, Sweden
Dr Brent Palmer, Lexington, Kentucky, USA
Dr Peter Reijnders, Ben Burg, The Netherlands
Dr Clifford Rice, Beltsville, Maryland, USA
Dr Richard Sharpe, Edinburgh, Scotland
Dr Tomoyuki Shirai, Nagoya, Japan
Dr Henk van Loveren, Bilthoven, The Netherlands
Dr Jeff Vos, Bilthoven, The Netherlands
Dr Gerhard Winneke, Duesseldorf

Without their significant text contribution, this task could not have been completed and the IPCS is extremely grateful.

A preliminary draft of the document was circulated to numerous scientific experts and IPCS contact points for their review. The IPCS offers special thanks to the following individuals for their substantial review comments:

Dr Wagida Anwar, Cairo, Egypt
Dr John Ashby, Cheshire, United Kingdom
Dr William Benson, Gulf Breeze, Florida, USA
Dr Peter deFur, Richmond, Virginia, USA
Dr Christiaan de Jager, Pretoria, South Africa
Dr Pam Factor-Litvak, New York, New York, USA
Dr Penny Fenner-Crisp, Washington, D.C., USA
Dr Michael Joffe, London, United Kingdom
Dr Taisen Iguchi, Okazaki, Japan
Dr Ken Sexton, Minneapolis, Minnesota, USA
Dr Mark Servos, Ontario, Canada
Dr Janneche Skaare, Oslo, Norway
Dr Mike Shelby, Research Triangle Park, North Carolina, USA
Dr Jorma Toppari, Turku, Finland
Dr Peter Thomas, Port Aransas, Texas, USA

Dr Terri Damstra, IPCS, was responsible for the preparation of the final document. Editorial assistance was provided by Ms Kathleen Cameron (London, United Kingdom) and Dr Larry Fishbein (Fairfax, Virginia), and Ms Kathy Prout, IPCS (Research Triangle Park, North Carolina) provided word processing assistance.

Financial support for this project was provided by the US Environmental Protection Agency; US National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences; National Institute of Public Health, Norway; European Commission; Government of Australia; Health Canada; Japan Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare; German Ministry of Environment; Swedish Environmental Protection Agency; Swedish Chemicals Inspectorate; Swedish Foundation for Strategic Environmental Research; UK Department for Environment; Food and Rural Affairs; and the UK Department of Health. Without these generous contributions this task could not have been achieved.